

A COMPREHENSIVE LITERATURE REVIEW AND ANALYSIS OF THE
RECRUITMENT, DEVELOPMENT AND RETENTION
OF MINORITY LEADERS

by

Trista A. Glover

A Research Paper
Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the
Master of Science Degree
in

Training and Development

Approved: Four Semester Credits



Dr. Ed Biggerstaff

The Graduate School
University of Wisconsin-Stout

August, 2005

**The Graduate School
University of Wisconsin-Stout
Menomonie, WI**

Author: Glover, Trista A.

Title: *A Comprehensive Literature Review and Analysis of the
Recruitment, Development and Retention of Minority Leaders"*

Graduate Degree/ Major: MS Training and Development

Research Adviser: Ed Biggerstaff, Ed. D

Month/Year: August 2005

Number of Pages: 49

Style Manual Used: American Psychological Association, 5th edition

ABSTRACT

The purpose of this study was to look at the available research associated with recruitment, development, and retention of minority leaders. The issue of recruitment development and retention of minority leaders has become a common concern for many occupational organizations, and educational institutions in the world today. The reduction of minority students attending and completing college, and the general lack of minorities in organizations have created a quandary for employers and educators who are trying to comply with the standards of Affirmative Action.

A comprehensive literature review was conducted to examine the factors that enhance or impede the recruitment, development, and retention of minority leaders. The study was focused on the following areas: the state of minority leadership today; a comparison of programs designed to enhance recruitment and retention, an examination of the different techniques that have been identified as being successful in recruitment and retention; an examination of what key factors have been identified to help engage and

motivate minority leaders; and, an examination of whether or not society approaches the development process for minority leaders differently than they do for the majority.

The research indicated that there is no definite answer in solving recruitment and retention problems among minority leaders due to the multitude of reasons that minority people have for leaving a school or job. However, there are many strategies that have been identified as being successful in improving recruitment and retention.

Lastly, recommendations were made to assist educators, student leadership coordinators and employers. The focuses of the recommendations were primarily retention strategies for educators and employers.

The Graduate School
University of Wisconsin Stout
Menomonie, WI
Acknowledgements

This is dedicated to my Grandfather for always supporting me and surrounding me in love.

I would like to thank Ed Biggerstaff. I would also like to thank my two surrogate dads Bill Siedlecki and Pinckney Hall. In addition I would like to thank my adopted family the DeGraff's who took me in under their wing to show me support, acceptance, love, and incredible generosity. I would like to thank Brandon, Rome, Alex, Uncle John, Chef Dave, Julie, Drea, Shamara, Bono, Courtney, Holly, Reese, and Reagan for your support.

I would like to thank Sue, Axel, Josh, Kellen, Jason, Danielle, Jesse, DJ, Pat, Tom, and Vic, a group of people who showed me that I was capable of going to college.

I would like to thank Dusty, Shawn, and Bailey for believing in me and making me feel as though I belonged. Also I would like to express my appreciation for always watching out for my vegetarian dietary needs

I would like to especially like to thank my three soul mates in life. These three people taught me the true meaning of friendship, love, loyalty, and family. My lifelong friend Eric who has applauded my successes, held me when I have cried, pushed me when I ran out of energy, picked me up many a time when I have fallen. I@n for believing that I can do anything I set my mind to. Someone who truly taught me how to dance, sing, laugh, love, and to live life and not just watch it go by. Last but in no way

least Dave thank you for inspiring me to want to be a better person in life. You have forced me out my comfort zone and helping me realize my potential.

I love you all, thank you for all of your support and generosity.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
ABSTRACT.....	ii
Chapter I: Introduction.....	1
<i>Statement of the Problem</i>	1
<i>Purpose of the Study</i>	4
<i>Research Questions</i>	5
<i>Definition of Terms</i>	5
<i>Limitations of Study</i>	6
Chapter II: Literature Review	7
Chapter III: Discussion	37
<i>Introduction</i>	37
<i>Summary</i>	37
<i>Critical Analysis</i>	40
<i>Limitations</i>	43
<i>Recommendations</i>	44
References.....	46

Chapter I: Introduction

Minority recruitment and retention is on top of the minds of many educators, student leadership coordinators and employers since the creation of efforts like Affirmative Action and Plan 2008. Plan 2008 is a program designed for the recruitment and retention of minority students in the University of Wisconsin System. Research has shown that without the above laws, plans, and programs, minority leaders fall to the wayside and are often overlooked for the talents they may possess. Chancellor Charles Sorensen (University of Wisconsin Stout, 2005) explains why it is necessary to have a recruitment and retention plan at UW- Stout:

The world is changing dramatically, and within a generation, the minority populations will represent over 50 Percent of American society. Understanding and celebrating differences is, and will be, the key to successful professional careers, participating in civic and political arenas and raising families in healthy communities.

After the UW- System declared Plan 2008 a priority for all of the UW schools, Stout discovered that both their retention and graduation rates are lower for minority students than the entire student body.

Situations like the one at UW-Stout are not uncommon in both the education and occupation areas. Minority students and employees have a lower probability of completing school and finding success in their occupations. "Minority participation in graduate education has shown a dramatic decline in growth, with significant implications for future minority participation in the academic professions," (Altbach, 1991, p.9). The literature shows that there are many factors as to why people do not persist in pursuing

their full leadership potential; discrimination, fear of rejection by family and friends, fear of failure, harassment, value conflicts, financial problems, etc.

“Retention begins with recruitment, with a good match between what the institution has to offer and what the student needs,” (Noel, 1985, p.14). Noel asserts that it is important for organizations to review their mission statements and pursue the type of employee/student that can create the best mutually served relationship. This is an important step in retention, because you do not want to put effort into recruiting someone that is going to not get what he or she needs from the organization and then they decide to move on. This is a waste of time, money and resources for all involved. It is important to know what qualities the organization is looking for in a leader, as well as what the leader is looking for in a position, in order to have a successful venture. One way to improve the recruitment process for incoming employees or students is to have a comprehensive orientation. Many studies have reported that a thorough orientation helps employees adjust easier, because they have a better knowledge of what to expect. It is important to note, however, that although recruitment is an important step in the process of retention, it is just that, a step. Often, when planning programs institutions put all of their effort on the recruitment end and loose focus on the bigger picture, employee development.

Institutions often believe that if they employ minority leaders then they have won the battle. The problem with this concept is that they put all of their energy into the front end, recruitment, and assume this means that minority leaders will feel obligated to stay. As any organizational leader can attest to, this is not the case. After the recruitment process, comes the development process. One way to help establish the development of the leader is to provide them with a mentor. This allows them to establish relationships

and connections to someone else that they work with, gives them someone to shadow and learn from, and also allows them to become acquainted with their surroundings faster. According to Martin (1985), retention studies show that people are more likely to become detached during their first year; therefore, providing them with additional support systems can help minimize unnecessary doubt and tension. "This points to the crucial nature of the first year experience and the importance of special programs that integrate students into social and academic environment of campus" (Somers, Martin-Hall, Cofer, & Vander Putten, 2000, p.258). In order for retention programs to be successful it is important for institutions to place emphasis on the recruitment process as well as the development process, but it does not stop there. It is also important when creating a recruitment and retention program to take into consideration the factors that may stand in the way of retaining a minority leader.

As mentioned earlier, there are a number of factors that play a part in the complicated process of retaining minority leaders. According to Sanchez (1987), some of those factors include things like economic isolation, traditional perception, and professional under representation. Economic isolation plays a big role in trying to recruit minority student leaders, because minority students tend to have an economic disadvantage, making it harder for culturally different students to attend quality schools, leaving them unprepared to deal with a higher education environment. Those students who get the opportunity to attend college are so concerned about meeting grade point average requirements in order to retain a scholarship; they do not take the time to get involved with extra-curricular activities. Another issue is that they become spread too thin, because when a student is identified as a leader, higher expectations are placed upon

them to be involved in everything. Traditional perception becomes an issue in terms of the stereotypes that American society has of minorities, which can prevent someone from putting themselves forward as a leader for fear of discrimination and harassment. Another problem that comes into play is that minorities do not have many of role models in professional fields, especially in the media. Very rarely is there coverage on a person that falls outside of society's ideal, which makes it harder for minorities to know how to become strong leaders or to have a desire to take on leadership roles. Again these are just a few of the factors that prevent institutions from retaining minority leaders.

It is important that educational systems continue to make retention of minority leaders a priority as Ellison, Smith, & Green (1987) point out:

The nature of the crisis, the grown knowledge and increased appreciation of the costs of discontinued education to society and to individuals make it imperative that effective coordinated retention programs become an essential feature of educational institutions (p.29).

It is our society that suffers when we ignore a problem that is affecting such a large chunk of the population.

Purpose of the Study

The objectives of this study focus on comparing and contrasting programs that have been developed to recruit and retain minority leaders in education, leadership, and occupational positions. This study also describes the techniques that education and occupation areas have identified as successful recruitment and retention steps for maintaining successful minority students and employees. This study also identifies key retention factors that help motivate and engage minority leaders in education and

occupations. Lastly, recommendations are formulated to administrators, educational specialists, leadership coordinators, and employers pertinent to recruitment, development, and retention of minority leaders. This study was conducted through a comprehensive review and critical analysis of research and literature focused upon the objectives of the study.

Research Questions

This study addresses the following research questions.

1. What is the state of minority leadership in the country today?
2. How do programs that have been developed to recruit and retain minority leaders in education, leadership and occupational positions compare and differ?
3. What techniques have been identified as successful tools for recruiting and retaining minority leaders, students, and employees?
4. What key retention factors have been identified as to help motivate and engage minority leaders in education and occupations?
5. Do we approach the development of minority leaders differently, and if so, should we?

Definition of Terms

For clarification, the following terms are defined

1. Minority- a person from a group that may differ from the majority in ethnicity, race, religion, ability, sexual orientation, gender, etc. A group having little power comparative to other groups within a society (Neufeldt, 1994).

2. Leader/ Leadership- a person of influence or authority that guides or inspires others in an organizational, occupational, or educational setting (Neufeldt, 1994).

Limitations of the Study

While there is a large amount of general information about recruitment, development and retention of both high school and college age students, there is minimal information on recruitment and retention plans that employers have for their employees. Although there are many recruitment and retention plans for both employees and students, many of them are too new to have statistical information to support them. Finally, it is difficult to generalize information on how to develop and retain employees and students, due to the fact that there is a wide array of differing reasons why people choose to take and remain at a job.

Chapter II: Literature Review

Introduction

This chapter is a comprehensive review of the research and literature linked to the recruitment, development and retention of minority leadership in occupational and educational areas. The focus of this chapter is to determine the state of minority leadership today, identify the similarities and differences of recruitment and retentions programs for minority leadership, recognize techniques that have been identified as successful tools for recruiting and retaining minority leaders as students and employees, and pinpoint the approach taken in the development of minority leadership.

What is Leadership and Why is it Important?

Leadership is the ability or capacity to guide and inspire others through emotions, words or actions (Neufeldt, 1994). Each person in society has the responsibility and duty associated with being in a position of leadership at one time or another, either in a social or work setting. Some people are better at taking on the responsibility than others, but this does not excuse people from having to do it at one time or another. "A leader is someone who can engage people for success," (Gubman, 2003, p. 3). Some people are natural born leaders and others have to work at it, but without leaders nothing in society would get done. Leaders, who engage their employees, have employees who have a stronger connection to their co-workers, the organization, and its goals.

Gubman (2003) explains that there are two types of leaders in the world; those that are drivers and those that are builders. Drivers are leaders that are focused on results. They tend to be autocratic leaders that need to have things done their way. Drivers tend to focus on the financial result, what will make them the most money. He believes drivers

tend to focus on short-term goals because they want things done now. Drivers tend to be critical, decisive, and in-control leaders. Drivers also tend to focus on individual team member contribution more than a team effort, as opposed to builders who believe teamwork is most important. They look at the long-term goals; they want things done that will ensure them quality and success in the future. They focus on people and processes first. Drivers believe that results stem from the people involved in the decision-making procedure. Builders like to develop consensus, and understand who is affected by the decisions that are made. It is important to realize that people can be either type of leader and be successful. The fundamental key in either position is communication for versatility. "Drivers become more engaging when they become more positive, patient, and responsive to individual needs," (Gubman, 2003, p. 12). The same is true for builders when they become more result and accountability conscious. The development of versatility allows both drivers and builders to become more engaging leaders. Versatile leaders understand the importance of focusing on both individuality as well as being a part of the team. In order to be a more effective leader there is a blend of development, balance, and diversity needed. Adaptable leaders understand the importance of the team as well as each individual's impact on that team. Adaptable leaders are those that get their results through people, make big decisions, are in the moment, have a good balance between long term and short-term goals, and show their feelings. Gubman stresses that leaders with a combination of the two styles allows for a better business strategy and a better work environment in the long run. It is important for society to help minorities develop the skills to become engaging leaders in order for them to find success. Gubman

(2003) believes that engaging leadership is gained through experience. This requires that society allow minorities to have the same opportunities as non-minorities do.

The reason that it is important to recruit and retain minority leaders is because at this time there is a shortage of minorities in positions of leadership. It is important to provide the next generation with role models that they can identify with, and to inspire leadership qualities in themselves. As Gubman (2003) points out, an organization it is important to realize that:

It's not just that engaging leaders win; it's the changing nature of business and the workforces. You have to become an engaging leader if you want to get and keep the talent you'll need to achieve the results you want (p.29).

He also asserts it is important for society to realize that they are in a talent shortage; "The demand for skilled talent is about to far outstrip the supply, and stay that way," (p.30).

This is precisely why it is important to educate and train the untapped resources that our society has in minority people. It is a necessity to provide opportunities to minority leaders in order for our workforce to have a diverse and an extensiveness knowledge and experience to draw from, and to which our culture can continue to excel in the future.

Today's Societal Culture

In many ways our society has come a long way. Slavery abolished; women won the right to vote and have careers; the gap in wages earned between the sexes closer, and people with disabilities are no longer sent to asylums and hidden away as though they are embarrassments. Looking at American history makes this generation realize how far we have truly come. Unfortunately, society is nowhere near perfect yet. "By its very nature, culture is learned human behavior which can be taught as opposed to racial or genetic

characteristics of an individual or group which are biologically inherited” (Sanchez, 1987, p.2). If society were perfect they would not deny people of differing sexual orientation health benefits at work or the ability to get married.

If society were perfect they would not need programs like Plan 2008 or laws like Affirmative Action because of problems with discrimination. UW-Stout (2003) explains how Plan 2008 came to be at their institution:

In the spring of 1998 the UW- System Board of Regents adopted “Plan 2008: Education through Racial and Ethnic Diversity.” This plan requires all UW System institutions to develop their own strategic plans for diversity that advance the goals and initiatives of Plan 2008 (p.4).

Plan 2008 is a program that was designed as a recruitment and retention plan for minority students in the University of Wisconsin System. It is a program that requires universities within the Wisconsin System to go beyond allowing minority students into the system and obligates universities to consciously and assertively put forth an effort to recruit and retain minority students. If there were not a problem, there would not be a reason for this program’s existence.

“Minority recruitment becomes a high priority as organizations attempt to achieve required Affirmative Action goals” (Roberts, Outley, & Estes, 2002, p. 40). Affirmative Action is similar to Plan 2008 in that it is a requirement for employers to make an effort to employ minorities, but different in that it is open to include women and people with disabilities. Weber (2001) describes the action as:

Affirmative Action requires employers to do more than ensure employment neutrality for women, minorities, and persons with disabilities. Affirmative Action

requires the employer to make additional effort to recruit, employ, and promote qualified members of groups formerly excluded, even if that exclusion cannot be traced to particular discriminatory actions on the part of the employer (p. 1).

“Given the complexity of challenges regarding race relations in this country, any effort to recruit ethnically diverse candidates must be well planned and take all issues facing the organization into account” (Roberts, Outley, & Estes 2002, p. 40). It is important to realize that there are many things that need to be considered in the process of looking at hiring minority employees, including the guidelines set forth by Affirmative Action. One study involving Affirmative Action in the military suggests that, although they support specific programs to increase minority and female representation among officers, it is not easy to actually increase the representation of those groups, because there are resource constraints which necessitate scaling down Equal Opportunity programs (Stewart & Firestone, 1992). Despite the standards and requirements of Affirmative Action in comparison with the general population, minority and female officers remain underrepresented in all services, especially among field grade officers and above. “What remains unclear is the standard in which social representation should be decided- the population in general, only comparable age cohorts in the population, the military population, or military subdivided into officer and enlisted groupings” (Stewart & Firestone, 1992, p.437). Tensions and discord are not uncommon especially in the early stages of Affirmative Action programs where standards and situations were still broadly defined, and which caused confusion and resentment towards the program and the people the program was supposed to be benefiting. Another problem that was noted in the study on military officer promotion is that there is a current promotion policy that says if an

officer gets passed over twice; he or she must exit the service. Stewart and Firestone explain why the process has some flaws:

Because promotion to the next grade depends on subjective as well as objective criteria (for example, promotion boards still require a photograph of the candidate included in the applicant file), rates may vary on the basis of individual characteristics (race, ethnicity, sex) and membership in upper grades may reflect underlying stereotypes about which individuals make better officers (p. 439)

Affirmative Action goes hand in hand with another law called Equal Employment Opportunity. These laws are managed not only by the University System but also the local, state, and federal governments. The fact that these laws are in existence and are a necessity says a lot about the culture of our society and its inability to accept people who differ from the majority.

Minority Leadership Today

Today's society often ignores minority issues, falsely believing that now that the Women's Rights Movement and Civil Rights Movement are no longer taking place, everyone's rights are respected. The problem with this belief is that they are choosing to ignore problems that are quite evident in today's society; for instance, graduation rates for minority students from high school are alarmingly less than graduation rates for non-minority students. In 2000, 86.5% of young Americans in the United States completed high school; in comparison, only 56% of African American students graduated from high school, and only 54% of Latino students graduated from high school (Greene, 2000). This says that something is wrong to live in a society in which everyone does not have an equal opportunity at an education and success. Minorities are not taking the leadership

opportunities before them. This implies that they are not receiving the same leadership opportunities that non-minorities are. Even if the opportunities are available to them, often times there are still numerous obstacles. Financial concerns, poor academic preparation, lack of family support, housing problems, lack of role models, roommate issues, work demands, and discrimination are just a few of the barriers that Anderson (1985) discusses in his research. Although Anderson conducts his research twenty years ago, these factors continue to remain an issue.

The three obstacles that seem to be the most prevalent in preventing minorities from emerging as leaders are financial issues, discrimination, and a lack of role models from a similar background. It is not uncommon for minorities to not have the financial means to take opportunities that might lead them to success in the future. Valverde (1985) states that it is not uncommon for both nontraditional students and ethnic and racial minorities to be from low income families:

It is fairly well documented that the majority of black, Hispanic, and Native American families in the United States are of low socioeconomic status and that a high percentage of students from such ethnic and racial groups who are attending institutions of higher education are low-income students (p.79).

Although it is reported that many minorities are from low-income families, it is a common misconception that all minorities, especially ethnic and racial minorities, are from low-income families. This leads to the stereotype that minority students accepted into schools and minority employees hired into companies did not get there on their own merit. Minorities are believed and often treated as though they received special consideration. Employers, instructors, and peers often treat minorities as though they are

somehow less intelligent and less capable of performing to the standards expected of them. “The under representation- and at times deliberate exclusion- of culturally different group members from American Higher education is cited as “proof” to the community at large that group “x” or group “y” simply “can’t cut it”” (Sanchez, 1987, p.6). This goes to show that not only does our society look at minorities’ abilities to do a job or get an education differently, but also there is a definite lack of minority role models in positions of leadership in society in the first place.

Recruitment of Minority Leaders

Wanous stated that recruitment is the procedure that companies use to advertise that a position is available. During this process it is essential that they depict the position to appeal and attract potential candidates (as cited in Larson & Hewitt). One of the most important steps in recruitment is to define the roles and responsibilities one has as a student and or employee. This is the best time to clarify questions that they may have before they get into a position that they are not prepared for and decide to leave because the job is not what they expected it to be. Clear job expectations and descriptions can help reduce some of the confusion. It is a process, which includes a preview that allows potential employees or students to make an informed decision about the organization. This allows for institutions, as well as, the potential employees and students to determine if there is an appropriate match between what the organization has to offer and what they need. “To promote this kind of compatibility, institutions need to review their mission statement and target their recruiting efforts on the type of student they are best equipped to serve,” (Noel, 1985, p. 14). It is also not uncommon for some organizations to have a strong retention rate once they get recruits through the door. The problem is obtaining

those first recruits. Stewart and Firestone (1992) noted this in their study on recruiting minorities into the military:

Results indicate that while retention rates for minorities appear high, little change in the demographic composition or higher grades are likely if current recruitment and promotion practices continue. Thus, programs designed to increase the numbers of women and ethnic minorities in the officer corps should focus on recruitment rather than retention (p. 1).

“Recruitment strategies have included pipeline strategies, outreach programs, financial incentives, and marketing approaches,” (Dumas-Hines, Cochran, & Williams, 2001 p. 436). Pipeline activities revolve around getting educators to encourage students at elementary and secondary school levels to continue their education. Outreach programs include pre-college experiences such as campus visits, attending seminars and classes that are representative of the college experience, allowing high school students the opportunity to visit job sites to get them interested in an organization early. The most common types of recruitment processes, however, are newspapers and advertisements (Larson & Hewitt, 2005). Other techniques include job/college fairs, hiring an institutional recruiter, employment or referral agencies, television or radio ads, organizational websites, word of mouth from current or former employees and orientation. “Fewer than half of the organizations used job fairs, employment and referral agencies or television or radio advertisements,” (Larson & Hewitt, 2005 p. 24). It is important for those that do use job fairs and employment and referral agencies that these places provide an adequate amount of brochures and handouts with pertinent information for perspective students and employees. This will help answer any questions that may not

be answered during the visit. This may also help persuade perspective employees to visit an employment office after the job fair (Johnson, 1972). Another common recruitment practice involves offering competitive benefits such as time off without pay, paid leave, competitive wages, flexible hours, scholarships, grants, and recruitment bonuses for current employees. "Effective recruitment practices ensure that potential recruits receive adequate information during the hiring process so that they can have realistic expectations," (Johnson, 1972, p. 24).

Valverde (1985) talks about how recruitment expanded from being just recruitment to being a step in the process of selecting and maintaining and students:

Initially the emphasis was on recruiting students from ethnic and racial minority groups and economically depressed backgrounds. In the seventies these efforts expanded to include retention of these students. At the same time the number of different disadvantage groups to be served increased; the term "nontraditional" students was coined to include older persons, women, language-handicapped persons, underachieving white youths, physically handicapped, and so on as well as ethnic and racial minority students (p. 78).

The reason recruitment needed to develop into a plan was because there was a failure in the system of just recruiting minorities. The problem was that recruiting minority employees and students did not mean that they were going to continue to remain at that institution. "Retention studies show that students are much more likely to withdraw during their first year than at any other time in their postsecondary education," (Martin Jr., 1985, p. 213). This alarming rate of employee and student turnover, especially amongst minorities, is what indicated to organizational leaders and university

administration that there was a problem. "It is not enough for us to brag about improved recruitment figures if those same staff members are quitting or being terminated because retention figures are being masked," (Roberts, Outley, & Estes, 2002, p. 44).

There are several ways to improve the marketability of an institution in order to increase minority recruitment potential. "Successful ways of marketing the university through pamphlets, brochures, and other publications illustrative of diversity have also been utilized to increase minority student enrollment," (Dumas-Hines, Cochran, & Williams, 2001, p. 436). Another way to do this is for organizations to take a look at their current makeup of cultural diversity and then analyze the results. "If universities truly desire to be reflective of a multicultural society, then each university must begin to collect and analyze data regarding its own campus and cultural diversity," (Dumas-Hines, Cochran, & Williams, 2001, p. 436). The reason behind collecting and analyzing this data is to provide a structure for developing a comprehensive plan to diversify the population on campus. Another suggestion would be to develop a mission statement that addresses cultural diversity in the organization. Several studies suggest that it is important that the creation of a mission statement, which encompasses an institution's feeling on diversity, helps facilitate a more open environment for diversity. "These mission statements should be publicly displayed, and openly discussed among student groups and faculty groups on campus if the diversity mission/philosophy is to permeate day to day campus activities," (Dumas-Hines, Cochran, & Williams, 2001, p. 435).

Another important way to improve marketability is to have a high-quality interviewer. It is imperative to have the right interviewer for the organization, because often times they are the first person that a perspective employee or student meets and views as the face of

an organization. A first impression is pertinent when a perspective employee or student is deciding their future, and if the organization would like to be in that future, it is important that they make a positive lasting impression. “The honest, sincere interviewer will come across more positively than one who attempts to peddle ‘pie-in-the-sky’ by painting a more rosy picture than actually exists for minority people” (Lee, 2001, p. 236).

One study suggested that recruitment processes fit into three categories; interpersonal in nature, information giving, and structural or programmatic activities. Over half of reported recruitment activities share an interpersonal theme (Lee & Cayer, 2001). “Within this category, schools attempt to personalize the admission process for minorities and to demonstrate the sincerity of the recruitment effort through personalized letters base upon GRE/GMAT minority locator files and visits to the campuses known to have minority students” (Lee & Cayer, 2001, p. 331). Another interpersonal technique is personal referrals from current and past students, faculty, etc. This technique is relied on quite heavily. Information dissemination consists of sending letters and recruitment materials to minority colleges or departments and special interest groups. It is not uncommon for schools to produce brochures and pamphlets directed at minority students. They also advertise in minority community newspapers, minority collegiate publications, and other publications expressing a special interest in minorities. The third technique is known as structural and programmatic recruitment, which deals mostly with a financial means of recruiting minorities. “Of all the required structural recruitment activities the most frequently mentioned was financial aid: fellowships, scholarships, tuition waivers, stipends, work-study, graduate assistantships, and paid internships” (Lee & Cayer, 2001, p. 332). Less than half of these programs receive external funding, but of those that do,

over half of them rely heavily on the external funding they receive. "Programmatic recruitment activities are of two types: (1) the counter biasing of culturally biased standards, and (2) the reallocation of department resources," (Lee & Cayer, 2001, p. 332). In counter biasing some programs have reported disregarding or altering the results of applicants Graduate Record Examination (GRE) due to a cultural bias. Other programs allow leeway in admission requirements for minorities in attempt to place greater importance upon actual performance in the program.

Finally it is important to have a recruitment plan that works with an organizational retention plan. As suggested by Holcomb-McCoy & Bradley (2003) in their article on recruitment and retention of minority counselor educators:

It has been documented that minority faculty recruitment must be coupled with minority faculty retention efforts to ensure minority faculty presence on college campuses. That is at the point of recruitment an institution must also begin implementing ways to support retention of ethnic minority faculty (p.233).

Several studies note that recruitment and retention plans are linked very closely. Also as declared by Holcomb-McCoy & Bradley (2003):

For example, the Council for Accreditation of Counseling and related educational programs standards require that counselor education programs make 'systematic and long term efforts to attract and retain faculty from different ethnic, racial, gender, and personal backgrounds representative of the diversity among people in society (p.234).

Factors that impede Retention

“There is limited benefit to recruiting staff from ethnically diverse backgrounds if people of color subsequently feel omitted from dialogue or are not included in decision-making processes,” (Roberts, Outley, & Estes, 2002, p.44). Many organizations have great success when it comes to recruiting minorities, but when it comes to retaining them, they have great difficulty and are not really sure why. One of the reasons for this is that companies are willing to go through the process of hiring minorities but are missing the elements of creating a welcoming, inclusive, and diverse work environment that allows for advancement. Roberts, Outley, & Estes (2002) insist that it is important that managers create an opportunity for all employees to have meaningful exchanges and an environment in which employees are allowed to make communication errors without being branded as insensitive, racist, or ignorant. Roberts explains:

“Without appropriate training, cultural awareness often emerges through making mistakes. For many people, it is easier to simply not interact effectively with co-workers different than they are, than to tangle with why someone prefers the label ‘African American’ to ‘black’,” (p. 44).

This is a sad state of affairs, but it is also a very realistic situation in the workplace and in society in general. “Interaction that is both encouraged and facilitated through organizational training creates empathy that leads to basic understanding, tolerance and acceptance of differences,” (Roberts, Outley, & Estes, 2002, p. 44).

An additional factor that impedes retention of minorities and women employees is the lack of advancement. Often minorities and women are passed over for promotions due to supervisor’s fear of differences (Hewitt & Larson, 2005). One fear that employers hold about promoting minorities are the differences in communication styles, which is in

part due to accents and in part due to cultural norms. They fear that employees will not understand what they are trying to say. Society has conditioned some cultures to be passive and some to be aggressive which feeds employers fears of promoting leaders from other cultures due to fear that it may turn employees away. Another fear is one of gender role differences. Supervisors fear promoting women for fear that employees will not listen to her, or fear that she may be too emotional. A further fear is one of promoting people with disabilities. Employers often fear that employees will not take a person with a disability seriously. "Although supervisors identified these differences as being difficult to deal with, these supervisors, over time and with the right support, were able to effectively supervise, support, and capitalize on the unique contributions of people from diverse backgrounds," (Hewitt & Larson, 2005, p. 249). "Research on civilian managers retention supports the contention that minority and women managers are more likely than comparably situated white men to leave their jobs because they perceive a lack of challenging/ interesting assignments or lack of career opportunities/ advancements" (Stewart & Firestone, 1992, p. 438). Quite often minorities and women are passed over for promotions without explanation. Stewart and Firestone (1992) pointed out that:

Empirical analyses reflect lower past promotion rates of black officers as well as women officers relative to white men. Recent EO/AAP programs in the military have attempted to rectify this situation with some success, most notably in the lower enlisted and company grade ranks (p. 439).

This is not a situation that exists solely in the military; unfortunately, it is true in many organizations.

Two of the biggest factors that impede retention of both minority students and employees are the issues of prejudice and discrimination. Prejudice is, “an assertive or hostile attitude toward a person because he belongs to that group, and is therefore presumed to possess objectionable qualities ascribed to that group,” (Johnson, 1972, p.30). Johnson says that prejudice is likely to suppress an Affirmative Action program and in order ensure success this attitude needs to be squashed. It is important to have a no tolerance policy on the topic of prejudice in order to ensure the success of the Affirmative Action programs and the success of the organization’s minority employees. Discrimination is similar to prejudice but it is the behavioral responses to the attitude that a person holds (Johnson, 1972). If discrimination is a problem in an organization, it is important that it gets addressed as well. Both discrimination and prejudice lead to self-isolation from other students and employees causing high attrition.

One additional factor that impedes retention is negative internal forces that influence persistence and achievement. Anderson (1985) believes that most internal influences fall into one of two categories; self-defeating perception and behavior patterns or confusion and indecision. Self-defeating perception is closely linked to self-esteem and self-concept. Self-esteem is a central concept in identity development. Zady & Portes (2000) define self-esteem as:

A particularly important trait that reflects how a person feels about the self being constructed socially and reveals the picture of a person’s developing consciousness about self, can be use to index individual and group adaptation in terms of mental health, schooling and related areas (p. 189).

One factor that affects self-esteem is physical appearance and social acceptance. Self-esteem is a concept that is mostly associated with adolescence. For minorities in a majority culture this often is not a positive view especially in adolescence when individuality is considered to be a negative trait, and the ability to blend in with society is considered a gift. Other factors that affect self-esteem are familial relationships, social class, and achievement in school. As discussed earlier, minorities often come from lower income families, and are typically from disadvantaged schools and tend to be under prepared for college. Low self-esteem can lead to procrastination and self-management issues. "These self-defeating perceptions and behavior patterns, consume a student's most precious commodities: time and energy," (Anderson, 1985 p. 48). Anderson (1985) also lists: loneliness, inability to ask for help, self-doubt, fear of failure, fear of success, fear of rejection, value conflicts, career indecision, and boredom as factors that impede persistence and achievement in school. Loneliness is a problem for beginning college students because they feel separated from the people they know and are forced to meet new people. This is not an easy process for anyone but can be worse for minority students because they tend to stand out in crowds. Inability to ask for help comes into play when a student is learning to cope in a new situation and they fear asking for help because they are afraid to compromise their independence. Self-doubt and fear of failure are connected because students often believe that they do not have the ability to succeed. With failure other factors are involved as well because students fear that if they fail then they will lose someone's love (Anderson, 1985). Minority students often fear succeeding because they worry success will mean they will have extra expectations placed on them by their families, expectations they fear they will not be able to fulfill. Value conflicts present

themselves when what a person believes to be true disagrees with what they are learning.. Anderson gave the example that students from a low-income background have a hard time finding a job to support their families while attending school. Another reason that students have a hard time staying in school is because they are unsure of what they want to do with the rest of their life. It is often hard to stay in school if there is not a goal attached to it. Students fear they are wasting money and creating debt by staying in school without a career goal in mind. Lastly, Anderson mentions the reason that many students have problems staying in college is because of boredom. Many students find the curriculum unchallenging and uninspiring. "Also, college itself may be less exciting than expected because the student is unable to find a way to become involve," (Anderson, 1985, p. 50). Students will often drift away from their families and other external factors that encouraged them to go to college originally and if the internal motivations are not strong enough it is quite often the case that a student will give up and no persist in seeking their education.

Factors That Facilitate Retention

One factor that would facilitate retention is the development of a plan for diversity in the organization. One retention strategy that is considered to be important in allowing employees to know where organization stands on the subject of diversity is, "developing, implementing, and evaluating a comprehensive plan for cultural diversity," (Dumas-Hines, Cochran, & Williams, 2001, p. 438). This is where steps like creating a mission on cultural diversity, analyzing your existing cultural diversity status come into play. The best way to start a plan for diversity is to research best practices to find out what other people are doing or have done that has been successful. Also, analyzing

current work environment would be helpful in this instance to discover what has working or not working in your current organization. It is important when developing a plan for diversity and retention of minority students or employees that accountability is built in. "Any successful retention effort must have accountability. Who is responsible if the desired results are not attained?" (Roberts, Outley, & Estes, 2002, p.44). Developing a written plan increases accountability and also allows for the responsibilities of the plan to be shared. "The process for carrying out this plan should be thorough and continuous," (Dumas- Hines, Cochran, & Williams, 2001, p. 438). In order to build a successful plan it is essential that "all levels of the administration support the need for diversity not just in words but in attitudes," (Dumas-Hines, Cochran, & Williams, 2001, p. 439). It is important that in your diversity plan you have periodic evaluation points to measure the effectiveness of the program. It is also important to gather data on employee attrition, find out who is leaving and why. The best way to do this is by conducting employee exit interviews that can help organizational heads identify problem areas that they may not be aware of. In order for an organization to be successful it must create a healthy organizational climate. Dumas-Hines, Cochran, & Williams (2001) quoted Webster's English Dictionary when defining climate as existing beliefs, criterion, or circumstances, of a group, period, or place. "The climate must show that all diverse populations are valued and that standards were not adjusted to admit or eliminate these populations," (Dumas-Hines, Cochran, & Williams, 2001, p. 439).

In addition to having programs that support diversity and multicultural retention, it is important to have the consensus of the institution's staff behind it. There are steps that can be used to develop support for a diversity and retention program. One step is,

“developing public advocates for specific retention activities,” (Smith, Lippitt, & Sprandel, 1985, p. 376). This can be done by placing retention on a formal agenda, starting conversations, reporting retention data to employees or your institution, and conducting special meetings. Another thing that can be done is discussing the institution’s budgetary commitment to retention by pointing out high costs of dropouts. Institutional directors can also establish intentions by writing proposals and organizing into special ad hoc committees. Finally, the leaders can develop leadership awareness while assuring deliberate use of the full powers of the president.

Another factor that can facilitate retention is establishing employment policies within the organization that include professional training and career development for all employees (Parks, 2002). Allowing minority representation on senior level management teams within the operational structure also goes a long way to demonstrate to employees that there are advancement opportunities in the company for them. “Such discussions- with potential action items- positively affect retention by lifting consciousness, awareness, motivation, and the spirits of all employees,” (Parks, 2002, p. 47). As discussed earlier, minority and women employees are less likely to remain at a job if they do not view that there are advancement opportunities. Also allowing and encouraging occasions for individuals to be creative goes a long way towards making employees feel as though they have the ability to develop in their positions (Parks, 2002). “Training opportunities such as leadership development, specific skill building and management strategies should be offered and encouraged to minority employees (as much as for any other staff),”(Parks, 2002, p.47). Another type of training that can help facilitate retention is diversity training. It is imperative to “conduct periodic workshops/training sessions for

program staff, directors, administrators, etc. on ethnic and cultural awareness and sensitivity,” (Parks 2002, p. 47). This allows minority and female employees to feel appreciated and also lets other employees know that diversity is valued by the organization.

In addition to the programs listed above there are smaller factors that can help facilitate employee retention formed on staff motivation; such as, recognition and appreciation. “Motivating staff, and providing recognition can often make the difference in whether staff members remain with the organization,” (LaLiberte, Hewitt, & Larson, 2005, p.197). It is essential that employers and educators recognize employee and student accomplishments and positive work performances, yet also recognize employees as people. This will allow them to feel appreciated and help motivate them to continue doing a good job. Setting performance goals and using various forms of recognition can accomplish this. “Retention programs must incorporate activities which facilitate attaining incremental and achievable objectives, communicate, that individuality with its inherent differences is all right, and demonstrate that deficiencies are not lasting detriments but are surmountable,” (Valverde, 1985, p. 85). It is also important to get the right people involved in the acknowledgement process. “Too often retention activities are carried out almost exclusively by student services, even though it is now clear that the key people on campus in a retention effort are those on the academic side of the institution: classroom teachers, academic advisers, and academic administrators” (Noel, 1985, p. 9). This is a program that can make a large difference and make give all employees and students greater job satisfaction. LaLiberte, Hewitt, & Larson (2005) created a list of easy recognition strategies that would be of no cost, little cost, or higher

cost. Strategies that can be used for no cost are verbal praise, verbal thank you, a thank you letter, recognition of birthdays and anniversaries, etc. Effective low cost strategies consist of clothing with company logo, dinner with a supervisor or professor, gift certificates, and plaques, as well as other items. Some techniques that are at a higher cost include pay raise, small cash reward with a personal thank you card, promotion, all expense paid weekend, birthday check or present on every employees birthday, etc. This is an effective and relatively simple practice that could help ensure an organization retains their employees.

Development Leads to Retention

The most effective retention method is the process of development. An organization is more likely to retain a student or employee if, after they recruit them, they go through the process of helping develop them as a leader. "If an agency is interested in keeping minority staff, it is essential to plan and implement retention activities that enhance the learning experience, support the cultural climate of the organization, and offer professional development opportunities," (Roberts, Outley, & Estes, 2002, p. 44). Training is the most effective method in developing leaders. It is vital to train an employee for both their current position and to give them skills in order to advance in the future (Johnson, 1972). Gubman (2003) states, that the process of development requires organizations to build leadership and talent, which is the way to build a dynasty. It is crucial for organizations to realize that not only are they training leaders but they are actually developing talent. This confirms Noel's (1985) belief that those that are in higher education need to realize that they are in the business of identifying and developing talent and not in just the business of educating youth. "If an institution creates the environment

where a student's talents can be identified and developed, an amazing degree of learning and personal growth can take place," (Noel, 1985, p. 2). "A more difficult challenge in retaining ethnic minority faculty is to change organizational culture to be more welcoming and supportive of diversity," (Holcomb-McCoy & Bradley, 2003, p. 233). In order to aid an organizational cultural change, one type of training that is important for not only the development and retention of perspective minority students and employees but also current employees are diversity training. "Purposeful scheduling of diversity training with follow up is essential," (Roberts, Outley, & Estes, 2002, p. 43). Holding diversity training will help open up dialogue between incoming employees and current employees and allow everyone to know the managers position on the topic of diversity and respect.

One of the most popular development strategies is mentoring and coaching. This is a very popular program in both academic settings as well as in occupational settings for retaining people of minority backgrounds. "Self-isolation from general student population and college life is recognized as one of the main factors that contribute to minority student attrition. Because of this mentoring relationships has often been a popular method of reducing isolation," (Dumas-Hines, Cochran, & Williams, 2001, p. 437). In college situations two of the most common forms of mentoring are "forced" mentoring and "academic" mentoring. "Forced" mentoring is where faculty and staff actively seek students who are reluctant to seek support and guidance. "Academic" mentoring is customarily used when remediation services are crucial to a minority student's academic success (Dumas-Hines, Cochran, & Williams, 2001, p. 437). It is typically preferred that mentors, faculty, staff, and students, should be of the same minority background. "These

mentoring relationships are important, because they may encourage students to participate in campus activities and groups that allow them to become more incorporated in the campus environment,” (Dumas-Hines, Cochran, & Williams, 2001, p. 437).

Holcomb-McCoy & Bradley (2003) quote in there study that:

Cross-cultural mentoring is of special importance for minority junior faculty.

Because of the small number of senior ethnic minority faculty in counselor education who can act as mentors for younger minority faculty, minority counselor educators have no choice but to rely on senior faculty mentors of the majority culture (p. 239).

In university situations, mentoring becomes a retention strategy for faculty and staff as well. Minority faculty members often wind up overcommitted as minority representatives for numerous committees and programs, so it is important to make sure they have a support system when they feel over stressed. Mentoring is also an important step for minorities in occupations because watching others who are already doing the same job can build confidence and support.

There are various other development strategies that institutions use to retain minority students as well, many of which are programmatic activities. “These activities range from utilizing existing university resources (as specific as a minority student office, or as broad as general services available to all students) to maintaining special minority-oriented educational opportunities,” (Lee & Cayer, 2001, p. 332). Some examples of special minority educational opportunities include internships in which students may be mentored by minority professionals or peers, tutoring, flexible programs, handbooks, orientations, seminars, workshops used to help with academic skills, etc. Other programs

focus on personal characteristics of the students' such as self-esteem building in relationship to their ethnic identities. Programs that allow them to explore a more positive image of their ethnic identities include programs like Black Student Unions, Hmong student organizations, Women's empowerment groups, Latino organizations, disability empowerment groups, and gay straight alliances. Other programs do not solely focus on the minorities at hand but have a broader reach. "University-wide approaches often target the entire student and faculty populations by offering workshops and classes to educate individuals on cultural diversity and sensitivity," (Dumas-Hines, Cochran, & Williams, 2001, p. 437). Two other very important retention programs for students involve new student orientation and academic advising. According to Forest (1985):

Recent Studies have verified that these two program features- comprehensive orientation and advising of new students and individualized instruction focused on development of relevant skills and knowledge- are not only important to student retention, but also to student learning and graduate satisfaction (p. 65).

The reason behind this is that this allows students to become acquainted with new surroundings. This also gives students a person they know and can trust to go to if they are having difficulty, which decreases the uneasiness of feeling alone. In Holcomb-McCoy & Bradley's (2003) study on recruitment and retention of ethnic minority counselor educators, the authors divulge created a list of commonly used employee retention strategies for minority faculty in academics which included: mentoring, salary incentives reduced teaching loads, leadership/decision making opportunities, professional development courses, and graduate assistantship support. Common successful student retention activities include: participating in student organizations, involvement in social

activities, involvement in cultural activities, attending lectures, general participation in extracurricular activities, and using campus facilities (Upcraft, 1985, p. 331). All of these illustrate the importance of development in the process of retention.

Building Teams to Enhance Retention

A further strategy to enhance retention is the creation of teams. The creation of teams will help both incoming and current employees get to know and understand one another. It will reduce awkwardness and allow employees to find common ground. Often minorities feel like an outsider when coming into a new situation especially when they are one of the few or the only minority in the organization. This can be a very intimidating experience. One thing that could help is allowing them to feel like a part of a team. Hewitt, Sauer, & Sedlezky (2005) state that very rarely do groups receive training on team processes in spite of the fact that many people have been asked to facilitate or take part in team activities. The process of understanding team processes and team building does not come natural to most people. It is important as a leader of a team that everyone has different past experiences, personalities, attributes, and weaknesses. Supervisors and managers often struggle with team development because they do not have the understanding of team dynamics or how to deal with the personality conflicts on the team. Understanding the dynamics of how teams are formed is an important step in learning how to build and sustain teams.

There are various in the process of group are formation. There are several names for these stages but Hewitt, Sauer, & Selezsky, (2005) refer to them as getting together, doing together, becoming together, performing together, and rejoicing together. The first stage is the process of getting to know one another, discovering one another's personality

traits, different cultural traits, testing boundaries setting goals, rules and desire outcomes. The second stage is when team members begin working together, differences in opinions, actions, and emotions are identified. This is the stage when conflicts arise. The third stage is where they get resolved. Effective communication structures are developed and the team begins to form. During the fourth stage team members develop respect for one another, the ability to problem solve occurs, and group members are able to finish task. In the final stage goals are met.

As a team leader when attempting to create a diverse, cohesive and effective team it is important to remember steps that make the process easier. The first of which is to establish group standards. This is a process that happens through brainstorming and allowing each group member to take part. This allows members to know going into the process what is expected of them (Hewitt, Sauer, & Sedlezsky, 2005). They also discuss the importance of using teambuilding strategies, which allows team members to get to know one another and opens up lines of communication early in the process. The authors also assert that planning a meeting beforehand can aid in its effectiveness. Both incoming employees and current employees will appreciate meetings that run more efficiently. Another thing the authors suggest to help with team morale is to celebrate team accomplishments. It is important during this time to acknowledge individuals for contributions that were made because it makes team members feel valued. This is something that can be done in a number of ways; anything from going to lunch to identifying and discussing milestones in the process. One of the most important steps to take is the process of evaluation of team effectiveness. This step does not have to be

complex it can be as simple as checking in with the team members and finding out how they felt about what they accomplished.

Successful Recruitment and Retention Programs

Programs that seem to be most successful are ones that have recruitment and retention factors working together. “It has been documented that minority faculty recruitment must be coupled with minority faculty retention efforts to ensure minority faculty presence on college campuses,” (Holcomb-McCoy & Bradley, 2003, p.233). Retention also appears to be more successful when there are mentoring, coaching and advising involved in the programs. “Organizations that use mentorship programs in which all levels of the organizations actively participate, regularly evaluate, redefine, and commit themselves to the program have greater success in keeping their employees,” (Hewitt, LaLiberte, Kough-Lindstrom & Larson, 2005, p. 179). Other programs that have reported some success are those involve new student or employee orientation, which allow them to get used to their surroundings. “There is also substantial evidence that participation in orientation programs and activities enhances retention,” (Upcraft, 1985, p. 331). In addition, creating teams in organizations is helpful in orienting new employees, because it reduces feelings of isolation allowing new employees a chance to get acquainted with their new surroundings and co-workers. Finally, programs that report the most success with retaining employees are those that have a diversity program that has accountability built into it and one that defines a visible mission based on the organization’s feelings about diversity, periodic diversity and sensitivity trainings, and programs that foster a healthy, safe, and open diversity climate. A plan in which, “all levels of the administration support the need for diversity not just in words but also in

attitudes,” (Dumas-Hines, Cochran, & Williams, 2001, p. 439) and actions is most desirable for success. It is important that all levels of management and administration support the programs in order to build consensus. It is important to make sure that they do not feel like this program is forced on them but something they feel a part of.

Conclusion

Research shows that minority recruitment and retention is a widespread issue in today's society with little indication that it is decreasing. Although some programs have discovered techniques that improve the likelihood of retaining minority employees, none have the cure. Some techniques including mentoring, financial aid, training, and an explicitly laid out plan for diversity have shown some improvement in employee and student retention. In addition, many institutions talk a lot about how having a diverse environment is a priority, but few organizations take the steps to truly make it a priority. Many conditions add to the intricacy of minority recruitment and retention including the diversity of needs of minority individuals, the inequitable pay scale for minority and female employees, prejudice and discrimination from their peers, lack of funding, and lack of support from families and friends. Society needs to work on changing the cultural climate to become a more welcoming, inclusive, and accepting environment for all people in spite of their differences. There are many roots and an abundance of underlying factors, and yet, there is no cure all for the problem. This creates a predicament for employers and educators that require them to continue to search for an answer.

It is clear that further research is needed. Unfortunately, recruitment and retention of minority employees and students is a complex issue that is inhabited by a number of multifaceted issues. As a society it is important that everyone works together in changing

the culture that they live in, in order to create a healthy environment for everyone to live.

Society is aware of the problem and steps have been taken. Unfortunately, society is still far from answering the problem.

Chapter III: Discussion

Introduction

This chapter includes a summary of the information obtained during the literature review. A critical analysis is included regarding the purposes of recruitment, development and retention of minority students and employees, frequently used recruitment, development, and retention strategies, common factors that impede this process, and successful recruitment, development and retention techniques. This chapter also includes limitations of this study. Finally this chapter includes recommendations for employers, student leadership coordinators and educators, who are looking to recruit, develop and retain minority leaders.

Summary

Over the past four decades, recruitment, development, and retention of minority college students have been on the minds of many educators and administrators. It was not until recently that society began to realize that there was a parallel between minority student retention and minority employee retention. It has become such a huge problem that the government stood up and took notice by creating affirmative action and equal opportunity laws. In more recent years programs have been invented to combat retention problems. In 1998 the University of Wisconsin System created a program called Plan 2008 requiring schools to create their own plans for recruitment and retention. The decline in leadership among minority leaders has become a concern in college and occupational settings because it leaves minority youth without role models. There is a talent shortage and the demand for talent is going to be greater than the supply (Gubman, 2002).

There are three issues that stand out as being the most prevalent in hindering minority leadership: financial problems, racism and discrimination, and lack of role models. Minorities are typically from low-income families preventing them from assuming leadership opportunities that are more accessible to the majority. Minority leaders are often passed over for promotions due to stereotypes and discrimination in the workplace. Minorities are also not obtaining the same leadership opportunities as the rest of our society, which becomes a problem when thinking of future generations. In 2000 86.5% of young Americans in the United States completed high school; in comparison, only 56% of African American students graduated high school, and only 54% of Latino students graduated from high school (Greene, 2000). That is a large portion of minorities that are not going to have the opportunity to get a college education.

Recruitment is the process where by organizations attempt to sell themselves as a place that is appealing for minority people to want to be (Larson & Hewitt, 2002). This is the time that institutions describe what they have to offer and answer any questions that perspective employees may have. Clear role expectation descriptions help clear up any confusion and allow minorities to make a more informed decision when selecting an organization to work for or a school to attend.

Recruitment was originally focused at recruiting minorities and those from economically disadvantaged backgrounds, but as time passed the disadvantaged groups that needed to be served increased (Valverde, 1985). Recruitment later expanded to include women, disabled people, underachieving white youth, non-traditional students, and so on. College recruitment strategies for minority students typically include pipeline activities, outreach programs, financial incentives, and marketing strategies (Dumas-

Hines, Cochran, & Williams, 2001). One of the most common recruitment processes for students is an encouraging child at a young age during their elementary school and junior high school years. Programs that allow students to visit colleges in high school are also very common. Another recruitment strategy that is commonly used to recruit minority students is to offer scholarships and other financial aid packages. In addition to these three things, most colleges develop marketing strategies to appeal to minority youth, brochures, web advertisements, etc.

The problem with recruitment is the realization that just because students are admitted and employees are hired does not mean that they will remain. It has been shown in studies that students and employees are more likely to quit during their first year than in any other time during their career (Martin, 1985). The problem is that many employers are willing to go through the process of recruiting minorities, but they do not want to go any further in ensuring the retention of their employees. For instance, many employees go untrained. This is a problem because training allows employees to have meaningful exchanges (Roberts, Outley, & Estes, 2002). Training also ensures that employees understand the expectations placed upon them. Other issues that impede retention revolve around minorities and women being overlooked for promotions, and external behaviors of prejudice and discrimination.

Factors that facilitate retention of minority people in organizations include a mission statement on diversity and more specifically a comprehensive plan to incorporate diversity into everyday work (Dumas-Hines, Cochran, & Williams, 2001). This demonstrates to employees that diversity is important to the organizations. Also, holding periodic diversity training also shows the organizations' commitment to diversity. In

addition to showing employees the organizations' commitment to diversity, it is also important to show the organizations' commitment to retaining employees in general. Organizations can do this by having extensive training programs for their employees.

The best way to retain minorities is the process of development. This can be done through a number of practices including: training, creating teams, allowing minorities to take leadership position on think tanks, and mentoring. Mentoring, coaching and advising are the most prevalent development and retention strategies that are used. This process allows minorities to become acquainted with co-workers and also gives them a reference of someone who has already performed their job (Dumas-Hines, Cochran, & Williams, 2001). Mentoring is a popular practice because it is relatively easy and inexpensive.

The most successful recruitment, development and retention plans are those that involve orientations for incoming employees, have a displayed mission statement on the organizations commitment to diversity, and involve training, mentoring, and a plan for advancement. In addition, plans for diversity tend to be more successful if there is accountability and buy in from other employees (Dumas-Hines, Cochran, & Williams, 2001). There needs to be someone who is responsible for the recruitment and retention of minority people, in order for the process to be a successful one.

Critical Analysis

There are several research questions that this study addressed. The following is the critical analysis of the original research questions.

1. What is the state of minority leadership in the country today?

The research indicates that minority leadership is in a serious slump.

The reasons behind this relate mainly to the way minorities are treated in today's society. Minorities deal with prejudices and discrimination on a daily basis in both professional and educational fields. The positions that minorities get placed in are not welcoming, supportive, and conducive of a healthy work environment. It is not uncommon for minorities to be passed over for promotions and other leadership positions within organizations. A reason that minority students do not succeed in college is due to the lack of financial stability. Many minorities are from low-income families and do not have the ability to finance their education without scholarships and grants. In addition, both minority students and employees are not properly prepared for their roles in organizations. Minority students often come from poor educational backgrounds that do not properly prepare them for a higher education. In addition, minority employees often do not get trained in the positions in which they are hired because companies are more concerned about recruiting than retention.

2. How do programs that have been developed to recruit and retain minority leaders in education, leadership and occupational positions, compare and differ?

The research identified that several programs that have been developed to recruit and retain students are similar to programs in both education and occupational areas. Occupations, education, and leadership, use similar techniques to recruit minority employees; such as, marketing plans (brochures, websites, commercials, advertisements in minority literature), orientations, and recruiters. They differ in the recruiting process in that students are often sought out in high school or college settings and employees are more commonly sought out in help wanted ads

and flyers. They also have similar styles for developing and retaining employees.

The most common methods for both employees as well as students include advising, mentoring, and coaching. Retention and development efforts differ for students and employees in that most cases students are given scholarships and financial aid, where employees are given salaries but it is not quite the same.

3. What techniques have been identified as successful tools for recruiting and retaining minority leaders, students, and employees?

The techniques that the literature review identified as being most successful in the recruitment process for both students and employees are having orientations and various forms of advertising. The most successful tools in retaining employees revolve around creating an accepting environment by showing the organizations commitment to diversity. Several sources indicated displaying a diversity mission statement would go a long way in allowing all employees to understand the organizations commitment.

Another tool that was identified a number of times is the use of mentors, advisors and coaches. This gives minority employees someone to identify with and turn to if they have questions or need support.

4. What key retention factors have been identified as to help motivate and engage minority leaders in education and occupations?

The literature review found that having reward systems helps motivate employees. Also, a process of recognition for good work that allows the employee to know that the organization appreciates them goes a long way towards motivating them. This process can be very simple and inexpensive. It can be as simple as a thank you card, or acknowledgment at a meeting. The process can also be a little more formal such as a

plaque or certificate, a dinner with a supervisor and so on. Financial rewards are also beneficial in both student and employee motivation; such as an extra scholarship or a bonus at work. The research indicated that it did not need to be an overly complicated process; just that it needed to let employees know that you appreciate them.

5. Do we approach the development of minority leaders differently, and if so, should we?

Research indicated that in some cases, organizations do approach the process of developing minority leaders differently and in others they do not. In some organizations they approach minority leaders differently in that they do not provide the same amount or type of training to them as they would a majority leader. With some organizations minority leaders receive more training because they are thought of as being less educated or prepared. Other organizations give them less training because they do not think it is worth their time. In some organizations all employees hired are treated exactly the same no matter what their qualifications seem to be. The research did not indicate, however, which was the better way. The one thing the research did indicate was that development of minority employees was important in order to increase retention.

Limitation of the Study

While there is abundance of general literature on the topic of recruitment, development, and retention of minority students, there is minimal information on the subject of minority employees. In addition, while there is a great deal of information on ethnic minorities and females, there is a limited amount of information on minorities with disabilities, and minorities with different sexual orientation. Another limitation of the study is the minimal statistical information that was available on the topic due to the fact

that many recruitment and retention plans are too new to provide accurate information. Finally, it is difficult to generalize information on how to develop and retain employees and students, due to the fact that there is a wide array of differing reasons why people choose to take and remain at a job.

Recommendations

In order to aid employers, student leadership coordinators, and educators to recruit, develop, and retain minority employees and students, the following recommendations are made as a result of the literature review and critical analysis.

1. It is recommended that a diversity mission be developed to ensure that all employees are aware of the organizations stance on diversity.
2. It is recommended that organizations collect and analyze data on the current make up of diversity to help develop a comprehensive plan for diversity.
3. It is recommended for both incoming employees and students to undergo thorough orientation, allowing them to get acquainted with their new surroundings and to ask any questions they may have.
4. It is recommended that incoming employees are trained thoroughly in the position that they hold, in policies and procedures of the organization, and in any future duties they may have to perform.
5. It is recommended that more financial aid and scholarships be made available to incoming minority students.
6. It is recommended for both students and employees that mentoring, coaching, and advising programs be developed.

7. It is recommended that diversity training involving all employees take place in the organization.
8. It is recommended that exit interviews be performed with exiting students and staff to discover any problem areas organizations may be overlooking.
9. It is recommended that institutions develop an organizational plan on diversity using the steps above and with built in accountability.
10. It is recommended that more research be conducted on recruitment, development and retention of minorities with disabilities, so appropriate recommendations and accommodations can be made.
11. It is recommended that more research be conducted on recruitment, development and retention of minorities with different sexual orientations be conducted so appropriate recommendations and accommodations can be made.

References

- Altbach, P. G. (1991). The Racial Dilemma in American Higher Education. In P. G. Altbach, & K. Lomotey (Eds.), *The Racial Crisis in American Higher Education* (pp. 3-61). Albany: State of New York Press.
- Anderson, E. C. (1985). Creating Conditions for Student and Institutional Success. In U. Delworth, & G. R. Hanson (Eds.), *Increasing Student Retention* (pp. 44-61). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers.
- Dumas-Hines, F. A., Cochran, L. L., & Williams, E. U. (2001). Promoting Diversity: Recommendations for Recruitment and Retention of Minorities in Higher Education. *College Student Journal*, 35(3), 433-442.
- Ellison, N. M., Smith, J. D., & Green, R. L. (1987). Access, Excellence and Student Retention: A Leadership Commitment. *Higher Education Significant and Contemporary Concerns* (pp. 20-51). Cleveland: Info-Tec Inc.
- Forest, A. (1985). Creating Conditions for Student and Institutional Success. In U. Delworth, & G. R. Hanson (Eds.), *Increasing Student Retention* (pp. 62-77). San Francisco: Josey-Bass Publishers.
- Greene, J. P. (2002). Graduation Statistics: Caveat Emptor. *Education Week*, July 19, 2005
- Gubman, E. (2003). *The Engaging Leader*. Chicago: Dearborn Trade Publishing, A Kaplan Professional Company.
- Hewitt, A. S., LaLiberte, T. L., Kougl-Lindstrom, J., & Larson, S. A. (2005). Fostering Commitment and Skill Through Mentoring Programs. *Staff Recruitment, Retention,*

& Training Strategies for Community Human Services Organizations (pp. 177-191).

Baltimore: Paul H. Brookes Publishing CO.

Hewitt, A. S., & Larson, S. A. (2005). Supporting and Training Supervisors. *Recruitment, Retention, Training Strategies for Community Human Services Organizations* (pp. 239-254). Baltimore: Paul H. Brookes Publishing Co.

Hewitt, A. S., Sauer, J. K., & Selezsky, L. (2005). From Grumbling to Getting Along: Creating and Using Teams to Enhance Retention. *Staff Recruitment, Retention, & Training Strategies for Community Human Services Organizations* (pp. 215-235). Baltimore: Paul H. Brookes Publishing Company.

Holcomb-McCoy, C., & Bradley, C. (2003). Recruitment and Retention of Ethnic Minority Counselor Educators: An Exploratory Study of CACREP-Accredited Counseling Programs. *Counselor Educations & Supervision*, 42, 231-243. from the ERIC database.

Johnson, F. R. (1972). Recruiting, Retaining, and Advancing Minority Employees. *Training and Development Journal*, 26(1), 28-31. From the ERIC database.

LaLiberte, T. L., Hewitt, A. S., & Larson, S. A. (2005). Staff Motivation and Recognition. *Staff Recruitment, Retention, & Training Strategies for Community Human Services Organizations* (pp. 197-212). Baltimore: Paul H. Brookes Publishing CO.

Larson, S. A., & Hewitt, A. S. (2005). Selection Strategies. *Staff Recruitment, Retention, Training, Strategies for Community Human Services Organizations* (pp. 75-97). Baltimore: Paul H. Brookes Publishing Company.

- Lee, D. S., & Cayer, N. J. (1987). Recruitment of Minority Students for Public Administration Education. *Public Administration Review*, 47, 329-335. From the ERIC database.
- Martin, Dallas A. Jr. (1985). Financial Aid. In U. Delworth, & G. R. Hanson (Eds.), *Increasing Student Retention* (pp. 203-220). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Research into action: Strategies for Successful Recruitment and Retention.(2002). *Parks & Recreation*, 37(5), 46-48. From the Academic Search Elite database.
- Roberts, N. S., Outley, C., & Estes, C. A. (2002). Innovation and Resourcefulness: Recruit and Retain a Diverse Staff in the 21st Century. *Parks and Recreation*, 37(5), 39-46. From the Corporate ResourceNet database.
- Sanchez, R. (1987). Teaching Culturally Different Students in Higher Education: A Practical Guide for College Faculty. *Higher Education Significant and Contemporary Concerns* (pp. 1-19). Cleveland Ohio: Info-Tec, Inc.
- Smith, L. N., Lippit, R., & Sprandel, D. (1985). Building Support for Campus Wide Retention Program. In U. Delworth, & G. R. Hanson (Eds.), (pp. 366-401)
- Somers, P. (2000). The Persistence of African American College Students: How National Data Inform a Hopwood-Proof Retention Strategy. In S. T. Gregory (Ed.), *The Academic Achievement of Minority Students* (pp. 249-286). Lanham: University Press of America Inc.
- Stewart, J. B., & Firestone, J. M. (1992). Looking for a Few Good Men. *American Journal of Economics and Sociology*, 51(4), 435-559. From the Business Source Elite database.

University of Wisconsin, Stout. (2005). *University of Wisconsin Stout, Plan 2008*.

Retrieved 7,01,05, 05 from <http://www.uwstout.edu/provost/diversity/>

Upcraft, M. L. (1985). Residence Halls and Student Activities. In U. Delworth, & G. R. Hanson (Eds.), *Increasing Student Retention* (pp. 319). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers.

Valverde, L. A. (1985). Low-Income students. In U. Delworth, & G. R. Hanson (Eds.), *Increasing Student Retention* (pp. 95-20). San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers.

Weber, D. (2001). *Affirmative Action Program Manual for University of Wisconsin Stout*. Unpublished manuscript.

Webster's New World Dictionary (1994). In Neufeldt V., Guralnik D. B. (Eds.), (3rd college edition ed.). New York: Prentice Hall.